

FILED

JAN 31 2013

**SECRETARY, BOARD OF
OIL, GAS & MINING**

Joro Walker, USB # 6676
Charles R. Dubuc, USB #12079
WESTERN RESOURCE ADVOCATES
Attorneys for Petitioner
150 South 600 East, Ste 2A
Salt Lake City, Utah 84102
Telephone: 801.487.9911
Email: joro.walker@westernresources.org
rob.dubuc@westernresources.org

**BEFORE THE BOARD OF OIL, GAS, AND MINING
DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES
STATE OF UTAH**

LIVING RIVERS, a non-profit association,

Petitioner,

v.

DIVISION OF OIL, GAS AND MINING,

Respondent,

EARTH ENERGY RESOURCES, INC.

Intervenor/Respondent

**LIVING RIVERS' OBJECTIONS TO
PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT
CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND ORDER**

Docket No. 2010-027

Cause No. M/047/0090

Living Rivers, by and through its attorneys, hereby submits the following objections to the proposed Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law, and Order submitted by US Oil Sands to the Board of Oil, Gas and Mining (Board) in the above matter.

Paragraph 11. Living Rivers objects to the characterization of what was agreed to in the September 18, 2012 stipulation. While there are similarities between the challenges filed with the Division of Oil, Gas and Mining (Division) and the Division of Water Quality, what Living Rivers agreed to in the September 18th stipulation was not tied to, and did not directly reference, issues resolved by the Utah Water Quality Board. This paragraph should be changed to include a more accurate summary of that stipulation.

Paragraph 35. Living Rivers objects to the characterization of Mr. Lips' visit to the site. That characterization is unsupported by the evidence before the Board and Living Rivers requests that the last sentence in that paragraph be removed.

Paragraph 39. Living Rivers objects to the characterization of Mr. Park's testimony related to area seeps as "[t]he most persuasive evidence" presented on that subject.

Paragraphs 40 & 41. Living Rivers concurs with the Division's objections to these paragraphs.

Paragraph 42. Living Rivers objects to the characterization of the record as it pertains to the leachability tests. The characterization is argumentative and is not relevant to the Board's decision in this matter.

Paragraph 45. Living Rivers objects to the characterization of the amount of d-limonene used within the process as argumentative and unsupported by the evidence before the Board.

Paragraph 46. Living Rivers objects to the characterization of d-limonene as unsupported by the evidence before the Board and irrelevant to the Board's decision in this matter.

Paragraph 47. Living Rivers objects to the statement that the Division will conduct other than visual inspections with regard to reclamation at the PR Spring mine as unsupported by the evidence before the Board.

Respectfully submitted this 31st day of January, 2013.

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Rob Dubuc', is written over a horizontal line.

ROB DUBUC
JORO WALKER
Attorneys for Living Rivers

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 31st day of January, 2013, I served a true and correct copy of Living Rivers' Objections to Proposed Findings of Fact Conclusions of Law and Order to the following persons via email:

Mike Johnson
Assistant Utah Attorney General
Counsel for Board of Oil, Gas and Mining
1594 West North Temple St. # 300
Salt Lake City, UT 84118
mikejohnson@utah.gov

A. John Davis
Christopher R. Hogle
M. Benjamin Machilis
Holland & Hart
222 South Main Street, Ste 2200
Salt Lake City, UT 84101
ajdavis@hollandhart.com
crhogle@hollandhart.com
mbmachlis@hollandhart.com

Steven Alder
Utah Assistant Attorney General
1594 West North Temple
Salt Lake City, UT 84114
stevealder@utah.gov


ROB DUBUC